

# Utilization of Media as a Tool for Marginalization: Foreign Bride Game Show Example

## Nesrin Canpolat<sup>[a],\*</sup>; Songül Omur<sup>[b]</sup>

[a] Associate. Professor, Nigde University, Faculty of Communication, Public Relations and Advertisement Department, Turkey.

Received 12 March 2014; accepted 8 June 2014 Published online 31 July 2014

#### **Abstract**

Media, which is one of the primary sources of meaning schemas in a society, paves the way for establishing different social maps with the statements offered. Television is one of the most efficient fields, where social group members are subject to classification as "ours" and "others". Television is not an environment, where images flow and echo only, but it is a tool, where individuals construct their identities, define themselves and reflect their fears, dreams and wishes related to others. In this study<sup>1</sup>, a foreign bride game show, which was broadcasted live and where the program aimed to add an individual outside of Turkey with different language, religion and culture to a traditional Turkish family, is examined on the basis of critical statement analysis. It is seen on the program that we define and construct our own identity on television screen with Turkish men, Turkish customs, and foreign girls' statements. Also, the language used in the program, the stressed words, the places shown, organized activities, the behaviors put forward showed that a clear marginalization strategy is being made.

**Key words:** Marginalization; Media; Television; Traditional Trikish family; Cultural development

Canpolat, N., Omur, S. (2014). Utilization of Media as a Tool for Marginalization: Foreign Bride Game Show Example. *Cross-Cultural Communication*, 10(5), 49-54. Available from: http://www.cscanada.net/index.php/ccc/article/view/5199 DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.3968/5199

#### INTRODUCTION

The World is based on relation among I/we and you / other. The relation mentioned by Marx through addressing identity among production and consumption addresses happenings among I/other concept welltimedly as well. "Each of them, is not other directly, it is not intermediary of other as well, but each of them creates the other while each of them emerges" Foucault, trying to show there is an general insane status for all societies, quotes obligation condition of the other as "It is obligation that some individuals, some behaviours, some events, some characteristics have to be divided into a series of obligation condition which keeps them out the system and the field to make public act as society". (Sözen, 1999, p.29; Marx 1979, p.254; Foucault, 2003, p.216). Necessity mood of the other is considered as presupposition for identifying subject itself according to Zizek. I need other subject for identify my own identity through a sense of identity as self which does not know about itself by its constitution, Thought of the other about my identity is engraved upon heart of my own private identity (Zizek, 2002, p.97; İnceoglu ve Çoban, 2014, p.8). Concordantly, the other is needed for an individual and social constitution to identify itself, it is not possible those constitutions position themself without the other.

When observation of historical process of the other, relation with the other is established based on visits done by Western societies to "the other lands" and predatory thought of those societies as initial contact among different culture and different societies. But this is an insufficient aspect for historical evolution processes.

<sup>[</sup>b]Research Assistant, Gazi Univeristy, Faculty of Communication, Cinema, Radio, Television Department, Turkey.

<sup>\*</sup>Corresponding author.

The Study has been represented at the 1. International Communication Science and Media Researches coferenceheld on 12-14 May 2014 by Kocaeli University Communication Faculty and Florida International University, school of Journalism andMass Communication and has been issued by proceedings book.

Discovering the new World has imposed consideration of existence of unlimited diversity of publics, countries and life styles in a finite world. When consideration historical evolution, humans do not stay in a stable place/ locality, they are always mobile to discover new lands. Human being, have to protect themselves from predaceous animal, to survive in severe conditions and to meet their needs, have to keep in touch with "others" (Schnapper, 2005, pp.25-26; Gönen, 2010, p.91).

Living is an event including communication net and activities in itself. We, human being, start to affect and change environment and to be affected by environment since existence of human being. The bilateral transaction lasts while our life lasts. We exhibit our identity, knowledge, earwitnesses, capabilities by our attitudes. Briefly, we use communication to understand, learn, tell and to reach others. We are in communication net as audience, readers and listener except being in communication with ourself and other (Usluata, 1994, p.7).

The net has lasted as humanitarian process where we make the world meaningful and share the meaning with others thanks to media (Mutlu, 1994, p.99). Media, designer of the net, has been living and processing like nets which we wonder or we do not wonder how nets stick on corners and does not come off though we try to get rid of well designed nets spinning by spiders (http://www.acikbilim.com). Media is assigned to particular duties in all social systems (Macbride, 1993, p.15):

Informing: Gathering, storing, processing and distribution of views, comments, message, data and news which are a necessity for taking decision about and realizing individual, social national and international events levelly.

**Socialization:** Forming common knowledge and though the fund which is going to make necessity awakening easier to make each individual to integrate with social life where individuals take place, to participate in social life effectively.

**Motivation:** Monitoring the last aim and recent aims to be reached by each social community; sublimate individual preferences and longings, advising individual and mass activities of making common aims real.

**Discussion and Dialogue:** Presentation of information units necessary for enlightening current problems about social interest, making reconciliation easier and making exchange real; to provide necessary units for making social interest and participation strength of all local, national and international problems.

**Education:** To provide necessary information assisting achieving skills and talents at all stages of life for improvement of thought and personality formation.

**Cultural Development:** Spreading cultural and artistic structures to protect historical heritage; providing enlargement cultural scopes through prompting imagination, esthetical necessities and creativity.

**Entertainment:** Spreading creative activities such as theatre, dance, art, literature, music, sport and game to

public and individual activities through public opinions like marks, symbols, voices.

**Integration:** Making individual reach pluralism through providing messages necessary for all individuals and groups to comprehend conditions, thoughts and longings of other, know each other interrelatedly in local, regional, national and international platform.

Correlation (Correlate, Comment): Media communication conditions and occurences as well as it correlates them with other occasions and establishes opinion (Yüksel, 1997). Functions, deal with positive effects of media above mentioned, reflects thoughts of main stream. But, functions mentioned by media give important tips about importance of media in individual and social concept. According to critical approaches acting up to class society analysis of Marxism; class dominating media production means also dominates property and supervision, it produces aiming at protecting interests of dominant class and media is mean of ideological reproduction (Bal, 2004, p.49).

Barret identifies ideology as discursive and semiological mechanism occluding, legalising, becoming natural and even universalistic and all of them may be called as making mystical. Ideology refers to a function or mechanism though it is considered as a general concept indicating it as making mystical explicitly (Güneş, 1996, Sözen, 1999; Barret, 2000, p.184). The mystical making situation describes ideological side kept in mass media as well. Ideology, carried by Media implicitly, expresses dominance over meaning with reference to techniques which media is subject to create discourse. The crucial point is that media depends on some discourses to create meaning and reader/ listener/ audience keeps individual in cognitive frame of those discourses. Media, which is one of the primary sources of meaning schemas in a society, paves the way for establishing different social maps to determine social peripheries. A lot of studies about characteristic of media have been presented. For instance, the most of studies of Van Dijk focus on subject of ethnic prejudice<sup>2</sup> and racism created by news of Europe in 1980s. Van Dijk exposes that Western Media has a negative approach against minority, refugees and migrants and negative publishes are created against those groups. Van Dijk represents that the negative approach in Europe has been created against people of the Third World countries and this kind of situation reinforces prejudice, discrimination and intolerance. Also Gonul Erhan discourses that a Turkish identity or Turkish image, abstracted from history politically or culturally, has been created on news about Bulgarian Turkish published on Televisions and Movies through her article with name of Stereotypes and Reconstitution of Social Memory in the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> One of the common and serious problem of prejudice is marginalization (Van Dijk, 1987, p.8) according to Van Dijk

United States: A Balkan Exodus and Midnight Express Revised<sup>3</sup> (Sözen, 1999a, pp.129-130, 139).

Television is one of the most effective courses classifying social group members as "on us" and "other" as well media is. Television either incloses and excludes others through its discourses. (Uluç, 2009). Postman, expressing the question about effect of television on us is set aside, expresses the question seems stranges as if it is asked what is effect of having eye and ear. Television became a culture according to Postman. Subject of his speeches is composed of television. Also those are considered as data beyond dispute and accepted as natural. Television creates meaning schemas in minds through it, as being aware of this, televises images of others symbolically and eliminates some of them. Therefore, television is not an environment, where images flow and echo only, but it is a tool, where individuals construct their identities, define themselves and reflect their fears, dreams and wishes related to others (Postman, 1994, p.91; Gönen, 2010, p.88; Uluç, 2009, p.124). Of course, the emphasized point is not about television is only function of marginalization but it is about importance of it on internalization and spreading marginalization practices. In this study, game show, which was broadcasted live and where the program aimed to add an individual outside of Turkey with different language, religion and culture to a traditional Turkish family, will be examined on the basis of using media as marginalization device.

#### 1. METHOD

Program will be evaluated through using critical discourse analysis method. Fairclough and Wodak summarize fundamental principals of critical discourse analysis as: critical discourse analysis refer to social problems; power relations are discursive; discourse builds society and culture; discourse processes ideologically; discourse is historical; relation among text and society is indirect; discourse analysis is interpretative and explanatory; discourse is form of social activity. Analysis will be carried based on a method with the name of device and formations where strategies, correlated contents are transferred into discourses to find answers of questions in discourses studies of (Aygül, 2012, p.196; Büyükkantarcıoğlu, 2012, p.179) and of Discourse Sociology Model of critical discourse analysis established by Habermas and Foucault through being effected by philosophical theory, on the one hand, in the sense of sociological perspective of Basil Bernstein, Ruth, Wodak, Rudolf de Cilia, Martin Reisigl, Karin Liebhar and Fairclough participated later.

# 2. CASE STUDY: FOREIGN BRIDE GAME SHOW

Foreign Bride Game Show, has been broadcasted on National Star TV and Star TV Euro channel broadcasts for abroad audiences. Sema Öztürk, who is frontman of the game show, expressing that there has been no broadcast in the World and it is broadcasted in Turkey firstly and aim of program is to introduce and date 10 young girls brought from all over the World to Turkey with 5 Turkish guy through considering religion, language and cultural differences at a home equipped with cameras. Öztürk, qualifying the game show as date competition but not marriage competition, emphasizes on if competitior may fall in love during competition who they do not fall in love during their love or if Turkish guys may fall in love with forcing candidates. Also audiences may have chance to learn about perspective of foreign girls who tries to fall in love in Turkey according to Öztürk. Participation of mothers of men candidates is also possible as well as man and woman candidates within the program format. Bride candidates will live at this home together with those mothers during 3 months and they will try to make mother and men like them. Winner will have an award of 100 thousand TL at the end of competition. Also each bride candidate participated into competition has achieved to win 3000 Euros. Study is composed of the first seven episodes of the program of 3 months. Researcher stopped watching other episodes of game show due to repeat discourses and detection of discourses set forth the aim of the competition took place. Any research method and content is not good enough to explain all of the world in sociology studies. As willing emphasized "our perceiving and experiences are never reflection of environmental conditions directly". It must be considered as reading of those conditions. It does not mean that we never know something really; informations means true instead of more information (Aygül, 2012, p.196).

### 3. ANALYSIS

Vienna School looks at answers to questions below through discourse: Which linguistic selections must be referenced for individuals and groups? What kind of characteristics must be attributed to those individuals and groups? What kind of arguments must be used for rationalizing ideological theory and consideration as acceptable during marginalization period? What kind of perspective must be used for presenting labels, references, arguments? Shall ideological statements must be expressed implicitly and indirectly or explicitly? (Büyükkantarcıoğlu, 2012, p.180). School philosophers have adopted a method aimed at determination of three different dimensions as linguistic tools and formations which strategies and correlated content in discourse is transferred into discourse to answer those questions. The

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Please see for article details: Gönül, E. (1990). Stereotypes and Reconstitution of Social Memory in the United States: A Balkan Exodus and Midnight Express Revised. *The Turkish Association Bulletin, 14*(2), September Indiana, 194-208.

method which is monitored by school to find answers in concept of the study.

Thematic context must be determined within the first stage, content stage. Participators, events, matters, motions, subjects, periods are divided as crucial units in a thematic context. Participation of 10 foreign girls, 5 Turkish mothers and son candidates through election among thousands of applications from all over the world into game show, which is studied, is discussed. Countries and name of young competitor girls competed on game show "Foreign Bride" are; Akvilina from Lithuania, Nishona from Uzbekistan, Lorraine from Netherland, Sergiyye from Azerbaijan, Guelioussia from United States of America, Veronika from Russia, Almirena from Hungary, Aliva from Kazakhstan, Maria from Russia and Olga from Norway. Cities and names of Turkish competitors who participated with their mothers are; Hasan and his aunt Mrs. Emine from Kayseri, Halim and his mother Mrs. Hülya from Konya; Taner and his mother Mrs. Aysel from Kocaeli-Gebze; Suat and his aunt Mrs. Zehra and Kaan and his mother Mrs. Nejla from Istanbul.

By interns stage which determined at the second stage by Vienna School, it must be determined which discourse strategies shall be used for correlating intellectual intangible schemas. It is possible that a particular meaning can be transferred into communicational period through using different linguistic strategies. When observation mentioned program in sense of linguistic strategies, at the beginning of the first episode of the program, it has been detected that equality and integration concepts were emphasized instead of Turkish Identity and Turkish Culture discourse. But some of word choices in the further episodes of the program were expressions of Turkish men, Turkish usage, foreign girls. In addition to that the most of sentences used by Turkish competitors have the characteristics of Turkish identity and Turkish Culture, those may be considered as crucial readings in sense of strategies.

According to that competitor candidates expressed themself during introduction period as "I am exactly an Anatolian woman and I will inculcate our foods and traditions to them", "My aim is to know somebody from different culture and to inculcate our traditions and introduce ourself to them", "Difference among culture is huge". Questions of frontman Sema Ozturk like "How a foreign girl can adopt Turkish Culture"? "All of competitor girls are foreign and they do not know about Turkish Culture" "As I see any of foreign girl did not kiss mothers' hand" can be considered in this context. Because, frontman tries to orientate competitors to sit what frontman wants them to say. Kissing somebody's hand<sup>4</sup>, special to Turkish culture, which does not come to

either audiences and competitor mothers' attention at the beginning, is overemphasized by frontman. As a result of awareness created by frontman, mothers reacted to foreign girls. Guelioussia from USA responded against kissing somebody's hand like "Kissing somebody's hand was demanded and I considered it strange. Kissing hand of somebody who I do not know was demanded. I kiss hand of somebody or man I love but it is strange to respect in this way", Loreina from Netherland "I really want to kiss hand of somebody if she is old" as response to mothers' reaction.

But, Foreign Bride Home game show connected to Arim Balim Petegim TV Show, which is broadcasted live on Star TV, for entertainment by further episodes and kissing somebody's hand issue was revived by frontman, Petek Dinçöz, after performing songs together. Petek Dinçöz made bride candidates to kiss mothers' hand through expressing like "For Shame! Hands of our mothers are kissed, age of them is not matter we said". Participation of Petek Dincöz to game show may be expressed through scenario theory. The theory, insisting on improving effect of television on knowledge and beliefs of human about the world, is a matter of scenarios created for particular behaviours rather than characteristics of model presented on TV (Coloğlu, 2009, p.66). In this context, Petek Dinçöz, who is frontman of another tv show, featured behaviours of bride candidates through making them to kiss hand, which is considered strange at the beginning of TV show, as ignoring characteristics and thoughts of candidates by scenarios created.

At the third stage: It is detected that which tangible units are used to structure discourse in strategical theory like word selections, figure of speech, metaphor, syntaxes (Büyükkantarcıoğlu, 2012, pp.181-182). In this context, the point, overemphasized in the first stage, is about cultural exchange to be taken place. A lot of Turkish Culture and Turkish Characteristic patterns have taken place too much while discourse or factors belonging to cultures of people from Usa, Netherland, Hungary and other countries have not been taken place or taken place merely within episodes observed; several surprises are prepared for competitors according to program format. It has been detected that surprises prepared are all about Turkish culture like steak tartar a la turca party, folklore group and other Turkish activities. Girls, drawing attention with their modern dressing style, who works as a model, are televised with a scarf on their heads and kilts when folklore group comes. Performing songs (national musics) like Canakkale Icinde, Olurum Turkiye'm and not allow for song, food culture and any performing belonging to bride candidates are considered as a strategy to set Turkish Culture forth.

Another point, drawing attention from the point of the study, is that mothers of groom candidates tried to teach Turkish language to bride candidate girls as of the first episode. Turkish competitors have expressed that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Kissing Hand tradition, which is crucial part of Turkish Culture, is considered as symbol of respect to older or notable people in Turkey while it is considered as flirting or courtesy.

they could use body language and even eggy peggy, if necessary, to keep in touch with foreign girls in the introduction episode of the game show, but Mrs. Zehra, one of the mothers in the game show, tried to teach Turkish to foreign girls through using white board and board maker. Foreign girls made an effort to Turkish language till lately of the midnight. Translation from English to Turkish and Turkish to English is available. But mothers felt that they need to teach Turkish language to foreign girls. Another point, drawing attention during the game show, is that Turkish candidate does not make any effort foreign girls' main language even though bride candidate girls make effort to Turkish language.

Culture is a factor making people come together and distinguish them from others. Religion and language are commonly used, distinctive qualifications but traditions, institutions, rules, folklore, architecture, dressing, food, music, art and even color, physical appearance may increase differences or take place of them (Smith, 2002, p.51).

Each society overemphasizes on cultural values and makes an effort to legate those cultural values. They had thought without corrupting it, to next generations. Islam religion which is a crucial part of Turkish Culture provides occurence of national identity. Islam has a crucial role over national identity which is exhibited by Turkists. Turkists had acted as Turkish Muslim while they have been mainly establishing mainly line of Turkism (Sarınay, 1994, p.172).

In this context, It has been considered that establishing Islamic discourse was attentive within the game show format. Competitors have been monopolized during Turkish bathroom enjoyment and in historical places and sacred places of Istanbul. Sightseeing tour begins by visiting mosque which is prayer room for Turkish people. Turkish people have been monitored while they have been praying in mosque. The monitored mosque and competitors praying is one of the factors supporting Islamic discourse. It is another factor supporting this discourse that Mrs. Hülva from Konva, one of the competitors, tried to teach Lorena from Netherland and Akvilina from Lithuania how to perform ablution and pray (Islam religion). This explanation makes us to think about theory that places like Hagia Sophia Museum, mosque, Turkish bathrooms and visual elements like kilt, prayer rug, scarf has been picked and chosen. All those elements, which are one of the most important factors among reasons make us to think about it, are adopted by people who live in society.

There are two categories of marginalization policy as We and They, and enemy and friend. Characteristics, distinguishing us from them, are emphasized and good characteristics are considered belonging to us and bad characteristics are considered belonging to them. Exaggerating 'other" concept and increasing distance among "I" and other is resulted by Modernity made

familiar I and "We". (Tuksal, 2001, p.592). Mother started to act reverse as they have said that there would be no discrimination and they would live in harmony in the first episode of the game show. Mrs. Zehra, who is one of the competitors, said "Foreign girls can not touch Turkish girls and I kiss Turkish girls" and Veronika from Russia responded to Mrs. Zehra as "Since they would discriminate then why did they come to foreign bride home". Mrs. Cevahir and Mrs. Aysel, who are one of the competitors, said "Foreigngirls can not adopt traditions and keep pace with us as Turkish girls do". Akvilina from Lithuania responded as "Mothers want us to be Turkish Girl". Expressions, said by Turkish and foreign competitors, show applying of marginalization policy up.

#### CONCLUSION

The matter, about which linguistic elections are used for reference about individuals and groups who are the first question that Vienna School look for answers at discourse within the program analysed, has been detected through description of Turkish men, Turkish culture and traditions, foreign girls and Anatolian woman. Answer to what kind of characteristics are ascribed to individual and groups? is given by some expressions of mothers ascribed unsuitable identity specifications to girls through saving like "Foreing girls can not adopt traditions and keep pace with us as Turkish girls do" and other mother ascribed perfect identity specifications to Turkish girls through saying "Foreign girls can not touch Turkish girls". Question, about what kind of arguments are used for rationalizing ideological theory and making it acceptable during marginalization period, has been commonly shared among cultures and distinctive elements like language, religion, institutions, rules, architecture, dressing, food, music and arguments has been used. Those are the crucial instances like steak tartar a la turca party, folklore group surprise, girls are televised with a scarf on their heads and kilts with folklore group, performing songs (national musics) like Canakkale Icinde, Ölürüm Turkiye'm and not allow for song, food culture and any performing belonging to bride candidates. Besides that mothers of groom candidates tried to teach Turkish language to bride candidate girls as of the first episode. Foreign girls made an effort to Turkish language, Turkish candidate does not make any effort foreign girls' main language even though bride candidate girls make effort to Turkish language. Sightseeing tour begins by visiting mosque which is prayer room for Turkish people. Turkish people have been monitored while they have been praying in the mosque. One of the mothers tried to teach one of the girls how to pray. Also, television is considered as a place where we determine and establishing our identity through expressions of Turkish men, Turkish traditions, foreign girls coming into focus in the game show. Emphasises of mothers like " I am exactly a Anatolian woman and I will teach them our

tradition as an Anatolian woman", emphasis of frontman like "all of young girls are foreign, any of them know about Turkish culture, as I see any of them kiss mothers' hand" gave tips about television is a platform where we reflect our fears, dreams, desires about others. There has been no aim about there would be cultural exchange even though it had been emphasized at the beginning of the program, and on the other hand, marginalization strategies have been adopted. The crucial role, undertaken by media during marginalization discourse, is to use a lot of mark or symbol, which is crucial in the sense of national identity, toward audiences without being noticed or explicitly.

### **REFERENCES**

- Aygül, Z. (2012). Observation with critical discourse analysis to address to youth of ataturk, discourse studies. In S. Arkonac (Ed). Nobel Publications, Ankara.
- Bal, H. (2004). *Communication sociology*. Isparta, Turkey: Suleyman Demirel University Publication.
- Barret, M. (2000). *Ideolgy from Marx to Foucault*. In A. Fethi (Trans.). Istanbul, Turkey: Mavi Ada Printing House.
- Büyükkantarcıoğlu, N. (2012). Critical linguistic dimension on discourse observations: Critical discourse analysis and further, analysing news. In Ö. Ömer (Ed.). Konya, Turkey: Literaturk Publications.
- Çoban, S. (2009). *Media, nationalism and other, der. bariş çoban, media, nationalism, violence*. Istanbul, Turkey: Su Publications.
- Çoloğlu, D. Ö. (2009). *Television is messiah or devil?* Ankara, Turkey: Utopya Printing house.
- Foucault, M. (2003). *Eye of the power*. In I. Ergüden (Trans.). Istanbul, Turkey: Ayrıntı Publications.
- Gönen, B. (2010). Reviewing other in sense of media anthropology. Kocaeli University Social Sciences Institute Master Thesis.
- Güneş, S. (1996). Media and culture. Ankara, Turkey: Vadi Publications.

- İnceoglu ve Çoban, İnceoğlu, Y., & Çoban, S. (2014). *Minorities, Other and Media*. Istanbul, Turkey: Ayrıntı Publications.
- Macbride, S. (1993). *A world a lot voices*. Ankara, Turkey: UNESCO Turkey National Comission Publication.
- Marx, K. (1979). *Support to economic policy*. In B. Sevim (Trans.). Ankara, Turkey: Sol Publications.
- Mutlu, E. (1994). *Communication vocabulary*. Ankara, Turkey: Ark Publications.
- Postman, N. (1994). *Killing entertainment television*. In O. Akinhay (Trans.). Istanbul, Turkey: Ayrinti Publications.
- Sarınay, Y. (1994). Historical improvements of Turkish nationalism and Turkish hearths 1912–1931. Istanbul, Turkey: Sefik Printing house.
- Schnapper, D. (2005). *Relation with other at heart of sociology thought*. In A. Sönmezay (Trans.). Istanbul, Turkey: Bilgi University Publication.
- Smith, A. (2002). *Ethnic origins of nationals*. Ankara, Turkey: Dost Kitabevi Publications.
- Sözen, E. (1999). *Our identities*. Istanbul, Turkey: Birey Publications.
- Sözen, E. (1999a). *Discourses*. Istanbul, Turkey: Paradigma Publications
- Tuksal, H. S. (2001). 'Difficulities about producing women policy in sunni-conservative environments' civil society in Turkey and Nationalism. Der.: Stefonos, Yerasimos vd. Istanbul, Turkey: İletişim Publications.
- Uluç, G. (2009). *Media and orientation*. Istanbul, Turkey: Anahtar Publications.
- Usluata, A. (1994). *Communication*. Istanbul, Turkey: Communication Publicatins.
- van Dijk, T. A. (1987). *Communicating racism*. London, England: Sage publication.
- Yüksel, I. (1997). Functions of mass media in society, 4. Boyut Magazine. Istanbul, Turkey: I. U. Communication Faculty Publication
- Zızek, S. (2002). *Fragile contact*. In B. Somay (Trans.). Istanbul, Turkey: Tuncay Birkan, Metis Publications.